

PLYMOUTH CITY COUNCIL

Subject: Improving Quality in Dementia Care.
Committee: Cabinet
Date: 6 August 2013
Cabinet Member: Councillor McDonald
CMT Member: Carole Burgoyne (Director for People)
Author: Dave Simpkins, Assistant Director of Joint Commissioning and Adult Social Care
Contact: Tel: 01752 304407 email: dave.simpkins @plymouth.gov.uk
Ref:
Key Decision: Yes
Part: Part: One

Purpose of the report:

On 15th January 2013, Cabinet approved a report which detailed a number of strategic projects designed to deliver improved quality and outcomes, and increased choice and control for people using our services.

Two of those strategic projects, "Improving the quality in Dementia Care and Improving the choice and control in day opportunities", required the Council to undertake inclusive and meaningful consultation with service users, families and carers. The consultation process started on the 27th January 2013, and in line with best practice ran for three months closing on the 30th April 2013.

Following the consultation process, this paper sets out a series of recommendations in relation to one of those projects - "Improving Quality in Dementia Care".

The Brilliant Co-operative Council Corporate Plan 2013 /14 – 2016/17

These changes are in line with the development of Plymouth City Council as a Co-operative Council as it supports the aims of;

- The Charter for Older People
- Devolving power and encouraging greater community engagement
- Community ownership of assets and services
- Greater control for individuals of the services they receive
- Strengthening the community/voluntary sector

In addition, the service will support the following priorities within the Corporate Plan:

- **Caring Plymouth:** People are treated with dignity and respect.
- **Pioneering Plymouth:** A council that uses resources wisely and the Council provides and enables brilliant services that strive to exceed customer expectations

Implications for Medium Term Financial Plan and Resource Implications: Including finance, human, IT and land

This project aims to deliver efficiency savings of £488,000 over the period 2013-16 in line with the provisional delivery plan savings targets.

A profile of savings is shown in Table I below.

Table I – Decommission Dementia Residential Care own provision at Lakeside

2013/14	2014/15	2015/16	Total
£'000	£'000	£'000	£'000
98	195	195	488

The following assumptions have been made in respect of the delivery plan savings.

- 1) The savings are based on 2013/14 budget;
- 2) The decommission of Lakeside would happen part-year during 2013/14;
- 3) The assumptions include the costs of providing suitable, good quality, alternative care.

A condition report concluded that to bring the building up to modern standards, including bedroom refurbishment would cost in the region of £850,000 in Capital investment

Other Implications: e.g. Child Poverty, Community Safety, Health and Safety, Risk Management

An initial Equality Impact Assessment was carried out to support the Cabinet paper of the 15th January 2013 was completed and as both consultations have progressed we have updated this to ensure we are capturing changes and gaps in the consultation process. In response to these recommendations, a further Equality Impact Assessment has been completed which has been informed by the consultation process including one to one meetings with clients.

When considering these proposals Cabinet has a responsibility to make sure that it gives due regard to the Council's duty to promote equality of opportunity, eliminate unlawful discrimination and promote good relations between people who share protected characteristics under the Equalities Act and those who do not. The proposals focus on meeting people's needs in high quality appropriate settings and enabling people to be part of their communities. As a result of our current equality impact assessments we are mindful of the unique characteristics of each person who may be directly affected by the proposals and any potential impacts will be managed through individual assessments and reviews and bespoke packages of care.

A risk register has been developed and we will continue to review, update and apply appropriate risk mitigation strategies. Through this process we will ensure quality and outcomes are not compromised.

It is acknowledged that this proposal has the potential to interfere with residents and their families' right to respect for their private and family lives. However, the proposal as a whole is in pursuance

of the aim to improve the quality of care for older people with dementia in the City within modern, purpose-built facilities, and this is a legitimate aim.

All efforts will be made to deal with the proposal in a proportionate and sensitive way.

Further Human Rights analysis will take place as part of future individual assessments should a decision be taken to close Lakeside. Following that analysis, any individual decision taken will focus on the individual's health and care needs as they change over time and detailed consideration will be given to the outcome of the Human Rights analysis. Any decision about appropriate care at that stage will be taken in consultation with the family and/or advocate and any other professionals as identified.

The Joint Commissioning and Adult Social Care Department is in the process of reviewing all care home contracts and this exercise will take account of the recently published guidance of the Equality and Human Rights Commission on how to embed Human Rights when commissioning for care. We anticipate that these contracts will be used when contracting with any care homes for new placements.

Equality and Diversity

An Equality Impact Assessment has been completed. This assessment identifies a number of potential adverse effects and actions to mitigate these and support people through the transition.

Recommendations & Reasons for recommended action

- The Council de-commission Lakeside over the next 12 months and support residents and their families and advocates to move to alternative homes of their choice.
- Taking into account feedback from consultation Cabinet is asked to make an exception to the general policy that no person currently residing in a Plymouth City Council owned residential care home will have to move if they wish to stay there.
- The Council will ensure there is support for families and users throughout this process
- Lakeside Residential Care Home should immediately stop taking new long term admissions.

Modernisation of dementia services across the City and increasing people's choice and control are in keeping with the Corporate Plan values of Responsibility, and objectives of Pioneering and Caring.

The Council will ensure there is no financial detriment to any resident or family member as a consequence of any move.

Whilst it is acknowledged that service users and their families expressed a desire to keep the unit open and available for new residents and the quality of care is considered good, this needs to be balanced against a number of other factors:

- the existing service does not have Nursing Care facilities and some residents are likely to need to move to a nursing home which can offer a different type of care for them as their condition progresses;
- the condition of the building and facilities at Lakeside does not meet modern standards and expectations. There are no en-suite facilities and would not meet the Care Quality Commission environmental standards if they were to re-register as a new care home;

- Lakeside is currently registered as a residential home and it would need to reregister as a dual registered home capable of providing nursing care to be able to meet the needs of all residents for life. The costs of doing so would be even higher than to simply upgrade the facilities as a residential care home and would be prohibitive. Plymouth City Council has not as part of its in house service, ever provided nursing care;
- there is other alternative good quality provision available across the City which is able to meet the needs of the service users at Lakeside;
- since 2005 the Strategic Direction of the City Council has been to move away from directly providing care services. This policy set out a new strategic direction to modernise older people's services over a 10 year period. This included the commitment that more people would be supported in their own homes and modern high quality extra care accommodation would be built in the immediate vicinity of our residential homes wherever possible;
- the 'Residential Care Update on Modernisation of Older People' Cabinet report July 2010 updated the 2005 strategy and set out the next steps. This included exploring partnerships to re-provide improved facilities for dementia care in the City. This was not about reducing the amount of short-stay (respite) or residential support, but offering a wider choice. This was in line with national strategies for both Carers and Putting People First. The recommendations above support this improvement and direction of travel;
- this strategic direction was in line with policy context set out in Independence, Wellbeing and Choice (2005) and subsequent policy initiatives such as Putting People First that promoted independent living, choice and control;
- Lakeside was historically used to provide short-stay (respite) on a limited basis, however this service has not been used in the past 11 months; and people are predominantly accessing respite in other independent homes across the City.

Alternative options considered and reasons for recommended action:

Keeping the existing service configuration has been considered however facilities in this home are out-dated and a significant investment would be required to modernise it. Lakeside cannot offer continuity of care for people with dementia as it only provides residential care rather than a combination of residential and nursing care. It cannot therefore provide value for money. Furthermore it does not meet the strategic aims of "Improving Quality and Outcomes, Increasing Choice and Control" .

Published work / information:

Putting People First 2007: http://www.plymouth.gov.uk/putting_people_first.pdf

Think Local Act Personal 2010:

<http://www.thinklocalactpersonal.org.uk/Browse/ThinkLocalActPersonal/>

A Vision for Adult Social Care, Capable Communities and Active Citizens 2010:

<http://www.thinklocalactpersonal.org.uk/Browse/ThinkLocalActPersonal/>

Care and Support White Paper 2012:

<https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/caring-for-our-future-reforming-care-and-support>

Cabinet Report July 2010: Residential Care: Update on Modernisation of Older People's Services (2005 – 2015)

<http://tinyurl.com/omco55c>

Background papers:

Title	Part I	Part II	Exemption Paragraph Number							
			1	2	3	4	5	6	7	
Equality Impact Assessment	X									

Sign off:

Fin	TOCS\PeopleF AC1314 002\10/07/2013	Leg	LT 17425/ 230713	Mon Off	LT 17425/ 230713	HR		Assets		IT		Strat Proc	
Originating SMT Member: Dave Simpkins													
Have you consulted the Cabinet Member(s) named on the report? Yes													

1. Introduction

On 15th January 2013, Cabinet approved a report which detailed a number of strategic projects designed to deliver improved quality and outcomes, and increased choice and control for people using our services.

Two of those strategic projects required the Council to undertake inclusive and meaningful consultation with service users, families and carers. The consultation process for both projects commenced in January 2013, and in line with best practice and guidance ran for three months.

This paper sets out the findings of the consultation process and makes a number of recommendations in relation to “Improving Quality in Dementia Care”.

2. Context

In November 2005, Cabinet approved plans to modernise older people’s services over a ten year period. Since that time we have achieved significant progress against the strategy set out in the Cabinet paper. We have de-commissioned a number of local authority homes in out dated buildings which did not meet current day expectations. We now have in the City 7 Extra Care facilities with 278 beds, providing high quality accommodation and support care. Plans for a further facility in the north of the City have been approved by Cabinet and are being progressed. We currently commission 15,000 hours per week of domiciliary care (5,000 hours per week in 2005). We have reduced reliance on residential and nursing care beds and now commission approximately 800 for older people (1,200 in 2005).

The City now has a jointly agreed Dementia Strategy “Living Well with Dementia” and has developed the market in line with this strategy, including the implementation of a “Dementia Quality Mark” for care homes. As a result of these improvements and increase in service provision, there are a number of independent sector care homes in Plymouth who now provide a mixed economy of care for people with dementia.

In response to this changing landscape, a paper was drafted and approved by Cabinet on the 15th January 2013, which included a number of strategic projects. The council has carried out detailed consultation with current service users in respect of two of these projects and this report sets out the findings and recommendations from this consultation exercise.

3. Improving Quality in Dementia Care:

3.1 Background

In July 2010, Cabinet agreed a number of recommendations detailed in a report ‘Residential Care; Update on Modernisation of Older Peoples’ Service 2005 -2015’, one of which was ‘to explore partnerships to re-provide an improved facility for dementia care’. The profile of people with dementia is becoming increasingly more complex, often requiring nursing care in the latter stages of their condition.

Plymouth City Council own and manage three residential care homes including Lakeside Residential Care Home a 29 bedded residential home in Ernesettle, which cares for people with dementia.

The building is out dated and does not have nursing facilities and so residents will need to move to other homes should they require nursing care in later stages of their condition.

In January, Cabinet agreed we could consult on the future of Lakeside.

3.2 Consultation Process

A full consultation process was followed in keeping with the Corporate Plan values of Fairness and Democracy.

The consultation asked for the following feedback:

- whether the Council should close Lakeside and the residents be supported to move to a dual registered home located close by;
- whether the Council should close Lakeside and move residents to other homes in the city
- whether there should be no change to the existing arrangement;
- the consultation exercise also asked stakeholders and those affected to provide alternative suggestions to the ones above.

Lakeside: Service user consultation and engagement

Consultation with all users and carers has been undertaken and supported by a dedicated social worker and support staff; it has been conducted in a sensitive and supportive way. The process has been carried out, with the aim to minimise disruption to service users wherever possible. Every effort has been made to ensure fairness, consistency and equality of opportunity for all service users who are directly affected.

The consultation process included the following methods.

Website

The Council's website was refreshed and people have been able to complete a consultation questionnaire or email comments into the Council as part of the consultation process so that comments were recorded and taken into account.

Written Questionnaires

We sent out twenty four questionnaires to families in respect of the potential service changes to Lakeside. We supported families to respond to the consultation through availability of a dedicated officer who was able to proactively contact families for their response. Questionnaires were available on the website for other interested parties. Staff at Lakeside were able to feedback their comments in this way if they wished to do so; staff meetings were also arranged. We also sent out information to key stakeholders including Healthwatch, the Alzheimer's Society, the Strategic Dementia Partnership Board and Plymouth Community Health Care and Primary Care.

Consultation sessions

Consultation events were carried out and arranged in order to give families and other interested parties an opportunity to discuss the future of the service. The events were held on the 12th and 14th February 2013.

Officers present at the event included:

- Independent facilitator,
- Head of Service Commissioning,
- Service Manager for the In-house Services,
- Independent advocates.

There were twenty six relatives who attended the consultation events.

An independent person was commissioned to ensure that the consultation was carried out in a fair and transparent way. They also created an independent report, summarising the outcomes of these consultation events. This report is available on the website:

<http://www.plymouth.gov.uk/homepage/socialcareandhealth/adultsocialcare/strategiccommissioning/serviceprovisionconsultation.htm>

Individual visits with families and people using the services

Families were offered visits at their convenience and anyone who was not able to attend the events were offered 1:1 visits from a social worker or advocate.

People who have stayed Lakeside over the last 12 months or who may be staying in the next 12 months as part of their planned short break have also been involved in consultation.

Advocacy support

To ensure that views were carefully captured, advocacy services were available and an advocate was present at all events. We completed mental capacity assessments and where service users lacked capacity to make decisions about the matters raised in the consultation we appointed an advocate to provide an independent report reflecting the views of the service users. The advocates were instructed to take into account all aspects of care and preferences unique to the individuals they represented. The advocacy support which has already been provided will continue as required if a decision is taken to close Lakeside.

Visits to an Independent Sector Home

In order for families to make more of an informed choice, we arranged a coffee morning visit to, a nearby independent sector dementia care home with on-site nursing support.

3.3 Consultation Feedback

An overview of the consultation report provided by the Independent Consultant is shown in appendix one however the consultation feedback can be summarised as follows:

- the families expressed a strong desire to keep the unit open;
- families acknowledged the limitations of the current facilities and particularly not having nursing care provision on site;
- there was a consensus amongst families that they did not want Lakeside to remain open for existing residents if the Council's decision would result in no new admissions to Lakeside and a gradual decline in numbers of residents and staff with the consequent impact from dwindling numbers on those who remain. (Families wanted to avoid a similar situation such as Frank Cowl House);
- families wanted a clear decision to be made by the Council;
- the standard of care at Lakeside was considered to be good, and families would want reassurance that any alternative care provision would also be good, should Council decide to close the unit;
- families stated that their priorities for any new or existing dementia service would be compassionate staff, a safe environment, and good quality of care with continuity of carers;
- if there was a decision to close Lakeside then families wanted enough time and support from the Council to find alternative provision.

3.4 Client Profile

Scheme	Number of Residents	Male	Female	Age Profile	Client Group	Other Info
Lakeside	18	6	12	all over 65 14 over 85	all dementia	6 service users have capacity and 12 lack capacity

Capacity assessments have already been completed for all service users by a qualified person, jointly with Health professionals. Work has been undertaken to take account of the individual's background, personality and interests. This will help to inform how we best communicate with them and determine what their preferences are.

Service users with dementia, including those who lack capacity will find it harder to contribute to the assessment process that determines where their future care needs are best met. Those who lack capacity will be unable to make final decisions about where their future care needs are best met.

We will meet with service users, their relatives or advocates as part of the individual assessment process to determine where their future care needs are best met.

For those who lack capacity, we will support their relatives and/or advocate to make a best interest decision in accordance with the legal processes under the Mental Capacity Act 2005.

3.4.1 Length of Stay

5 service users have been at Lakeside less than 1 year

6 service users under 2 years

7 service users more than 2 years (of these 3 have been at Lakeside for 5 or more years with a further one residing there for 10 years).

3.5 Condition of Lakeside

Lakeside Residential Care Home is a 29 bedded residential home in Ernesettle, which cares for people with dementia. The building is out dated and does not have nursing facilities and so residents will need to move to other homes should they require nursing care in later stages of their condition. As part of this consultation an inspection of the building was completed by asset management to ascertain the costs of bringing the building up to modern standards. The report concluded that to bring the building up to modern standards, including bedroom refurbishment would be in the region of £850,000.

3.6 Market Information:

Presently within the City there are 38 homes that provide dementia care, 26 of them have the Dementia Quality Mark.

There are a number of dual registered dementia care homes available in the City. There is also a new, purpose-built registered home in the vicinity of Lakeside, where there are currently 34 vacancies. There are therefore more than adequate dual registered facilities to meet the needs of the 18 service users currently at Lakeside.

In order to ensure the quality of provision is high and maintained, we have invested in a Quality Assurance & Improvement Team who proactively work with care homes to improve the quality of care.

4. Equality Impact Assessment

An initial Equality Impact assessment was carried out to support the Cabinet paper of the 15th January 2013 was completed and as both consultations have progressed we have updated this to ensure we are capturing changes and gaps in the consultation process. In response to these recommendations a further Equality Impact Assessment has been completed based which has been informed by the consultation process. We are mindful of the unique characteristics of each person who may be directly affected by the proposals and will continue to assess for differential impacts throughout the process.

5. Staff Engagement

Throughout the consultation period staff have been able to provide us with their views through the website and questionnaires. Meetings with staff have also been carried out to ensure they are both informed and consulted with. Where needed staff have supported our service users in engaging with the consultation process.

The recommendations set out in this report will have impact on staff and a comprehensive human resource process and plan will be available and the relevant unions consulted with prior to formal consultation with staff if the recommendations are agreed by Council.

Our intentions are to support staff through the proposed de-commissioning of Lakeside. This process will aim to find suitable alternative employment (through the redundancy avoidance policy) with the Council. Full use will be made of Plymouth City Council's resources, for example, redeployment and the employee assistance programme. However, it is anticipated that not all staff will be successful in finding alternative roles and that some redundancies will be unavoidable.

Appendix One

Consultation Report - the future of Lakeside Residential Home

Overview

Over the last few years, Plymouth City Council has made significant progress in introducing more personalised approaches which help people to have more choice and control over the care and support they receive, enabling them to live the life they choose.

Amongst the key strategic projects that will deliver “Improved Quality and Outcomes and Increased Choice and Control” is improving the quality in dementia care.

Plymouth City Council has been seeking views, through a consultation process, on ways to improve residential provision across the city for people with dementia. The focus for the consultation was on the future of Lakeside Residential Home.

Lakeside is an out-dated building and there are opportunities to consider other services which have better facilities - for example, en-suite bedrooms with greater personal space. Lakeside is not registered to deliver on site nursing care and as a result some people have had to move homes when nursing care has been required. Alternative options could offer continuity of care.

The consultation period ran for three months until the 30th April 2013.

At the beginning of February all 21 families of service users of Lakeside Residential Home were sent a questionnaire for completion and were invited to attend a consultation event. A total of 14 service user families attended these events.

In the interim, the manager of Lakeside had prepared profiles of the residents so that there was a clearer understanding of each individual’s needs.

Two consultation events were held:

Consultation Event 1 – Tues 12th February 2013 10am-midday St Budeaux Library

In attendance

Jean Humphries	External Facilitator
Debbie Butcher	PCC ASC Strategic Commissioner
Caroline Paterson	PCC ASC Quality Improvement Manager
Julian Moulard	PCC ASC Service Manager
Sherran Dean	PCC ASC Social Worker
Phil Fitzsimmons	The Highbury Trust (Advocacy Service)

Consultation Event 2 - Thurs 14th February 2013 2.00–4.00pm the Highbury Trust

In attendance

Jean Humphries	External Facilitator
Debbie Butcher	PCC ASC Strategic Commissioner
Caroline Paterson	PCC ASC Quality Improvement Manager
Julian Moulard	PCC ASC Service Manager
Sherran Dean	PCC ASC Social Worker
Phil Fitzsimmons	The Highbury Trust (Advocacy Service)

The format for both events was as follows:

- ◆ **Introductions** - Debbie Butcher, Strategic Commissioning Manager for Plymouth City Council stressed the importance of impartiality so that relatives of residents in Lakeside could have confidence in the consultation process. Jean Humphries, an independent facilitator, was in attendance to oversee the discussions and record feedback and comments. Phil Fitzsimmons, the Highbury Trust, provided an independent advocacy service for the process. In addition, Sherran Dean, Social Worker, provided support for service users and their families with a follow up social care assessment to assess individual needs.
- ◆ **First table top discussion led by an ASC facilitator** – to gather as many views as possible about current use of the service and key priorities for future services.
- ◆ **Feedback session** – led by external facilitator
- ◆ **Second table top discussion led by an ASC facilitator** - to consider options for residential care i.e. –
 1. Close Lakeside and be supported to move to a dual registered care home, located close by, that can also provide nursing care if needs change in future
 2. Close Lakeside and consider another home that is experienced in delivering care to people with dementia
 3. Remain living in Lakeside
- ◆ **Feedback session** – led by external facilitator
- ◆ **What happens next** – The external facilitator informed the group that whilst no further consultation events had been planned, individual meetings with family members could be arranged. In addition, relatives were invited to a coffee morning at Waypoints on the 20th February with an opportunity to have a tour of the home and to ask any questions. Debbie Butcher informed the group of the decision making process and the date of Cabinet when the results of the consultation would be discussed and a decision made on the future of Lakeside.
- ◆ The external facilitator thanked the families for their time and invited any attendees who felt their concerns had not been addressed adequately to speak with her separately after the event - or to contact Debbie Butcher directly. Debbie Butcher also confirmed that extracts from table discussions would be written into a report for Cabinet and sent to all families attending the events.

Summary of comments and views from Consultation events

Priorities for services

- Security of building to minimise wandering
- Shared rooms to accommodate couples
- Family members being close / having easy transport access to home
- Friendly and happy environment / friendly staff
- Well-trained staff
- Dignity and respect
- Good standard of care
- Good nutritious food
- Keep it simple – limit confusion by avoiding complex environments/facilities

Extracts from comments made by families

- Worried about losing home identity – staff at Lakeside consider residents as their second family. Likely to be too impersonal in a larger unit.
- Lakeside is in a good location with a nice outlook and close to the GP Surgery. It is open and airy with a separate dining room – very important that residents are encouraged to socialise and are not fed in their own rooms.
- En suite facilities provide very little added value as most frail elderly do not shower/bath on a daily basis and are often confused with different levers and knobs on bathroom hardware. The new wet room is ideal for residents.
- Lakeside staff know the residents very well and they provide excellent quality of care.
- The home seems to have a low staff turnover which is good – residents like familiarity.
- Families would like an opportunity to have a meal with a resident
- Fewer trips are provided now – perhaps another home would provide that
- Would like more consistency in staff members supporting residents
- Lakeside provides an excellent service, also offering manicures and hairdressing
- The home never smells
- There is a smell near the lift
- Rooms are beautifully decorated – the home was quite depressing years ago
- Having en suite facilities doesn't mean it's a good home
- Would like more people involved in her mother's care
- Has Lakeside got the DQM (Dementia Quality Mark)? – Yes
- Do Waypoints have vacancies? – Yes
- We just want the best for Mum
- Staff do a lot of different things with the residents and will often ring up family members to discuss care/issues
- Thinks Mum would like an en suite

In summary, family members expressed a strong desire for Lakeside to remain open. However:

- They didn't agree with keeping Lakeside open if no further residents were to be admitted - they do not want the service run down (quoting Frank Cowl House)
- Some family members agreed to attend Waypoints coffee morning or to arrange a separate visit to talk to staff and have a tour of the building.

Report Author: Jean Humphries (Consultation event facilitator)

Date: 17th April 2013